

CLINICAL ETHICS CONSULTATION
FIRST INTERNATIONAL ASSESSMENT SUMMIT
April 4-6, 2003

Cleveland Renaissance Hotel

*24 Public Square
Cleveland, OH 44113
Phone: 216-696-5600*

Sponsored by

Department of Bioethics
Cleveland Clinic Foundation

*

F. J. O'Neill Chair in Clinical Bioethics
Cleveland Clinic Foundation

*

Institute for Applied Ethics and Medical Ethics
University of Basel

Collaborating Organizations

American Society for Bioethics and Humanities
Australasian Bioethics Society
Bioethics Education Network of Ohio
Canadian Bioethics Society
European Society for Philosophy of Medicine and Healthcare
European Association of Centres of Medical Ethics
International Association of Bioethics Education Network
Swiss Academy of Medical Sciences

Scientific Committee

Co-Chairs

George J. Agich, Ph.D., Cleveland Clinic Foundation, USA
Stella Reiter-Theil, Ph.D., University of Basel, Switzerland

Members

Mark P. Aulisio, Ph.D., Case Western Reserve University, USA
Jeffrey T. Berger, M.D., FACP, SUNY Stoney Brook, USA
Nikola Biller-Andorno, M.D., Ph.D., University of Göttingen, Germany
Katrina A. Bramstedt, Ph.D., Cleveland Clinic Foundation, USA
Ronald Cranford, M.D., University of Minnesota, USA
Dan Dugan, Ph.D., Park Ridge Center, USA
Stuart G. Finder, Ph.D., Vanderbilt University, USA
Paul J. Ford, Ph.D., Cleveland Clinic Foundation, USA
Jacqueline Glover, Ph.D., University of West Virginia, USA
Christine Harrison, Ph.D., Hospital for Sick Children, Canada
Emilio Mordini, M.D., Bioethical Commission of the National Research Council, Italy

John C. Moskop, Ph.D., East Carolina University, USA
 Susan Ruben, Ph.D., Ethics Practice, USA
 Paul Schotsmans, Ph.D., University of Leuven, The Netherlands
 Joy Skeel, Ph.D., Medical College of Ohio, USA
 Jeffrey Spike, Ph.D., University of Rochester, USA
 Henk Ten Have, Ph.D., M.D., Catholic University of Nijmegen, The Netherlands
 George Webster, Ph.D., University of Manitoba, Canada
 Kathryn L. Weise, M.D., Cleveland Clinic Foundation, USA

April 4, 2003

7:30 a.m. Registration and Continental Breakfast

8:30 a.m. Opening Session

George J. Agich, Ph.D., Cleveland Clinic Foundation
Stella Reiter-Theil, Ph.D., University of Basel

9:00 a.m. Plenary Session

Development of Ethics Consultation in the United States

Ronald Cranford, M.D.
 University of Minnesota

10:30 a.m. Break

10:45-12:15 Concurrent Sessions

SESSION 1: DOCUMENTATION/COMMUNICATION

E-Consultation: Ethics Consultation Over the Internet, A Case Study

Robert Baker, Union College

Electronic Tracking of Consultation (ETC): An Innovative System for Improving Quality in Ethics Consultation

Kenneth A. Berkowitz, Barbara L. Chanko, and Ellen Fox, National Center for Ethics in Health Care

Elements of the Clinical Ethics Consultation Process: A Summary Document for Assisting the Development of Consultation Services

Bashir Jiwani and Rosemarie Muto, Provincial Health Ethics Network

SESSION 2: EVALUATION OF ETHICS CONSULTATION

Use of Simulated Ethics Consultation to Evaluate Ethics Consultation Teams (PANEL) [ends at 11:45]

Eugene C. Grochowski, Michael A. Williams, Cynda Hylton Rushton, Carlton Haywood, Tyler Reimschisel, and John H. Shatzer, Johns Hopkins University

SESSION 3: CASE ANALYSIS: DISABILITY, FUTILITY, AND LIVING DONATION

Do I have to be the new me I didn't choose? Experience with Ethics Consultation on quadriplegic spinal cord-injured patients?

Cynthiane J. Morgenweck, and Arthur R. Derse, Medical College of Wisconsin

"I shouldn't have allowed you to write a DNR order for my wife!" A Case of Medical Futility?

Martin L. Smith, Anne L. Flamm, and Gregory H. Botz, The University of Texas

M.D. Anderson Cancer Center

Organ Retrieval From a Mentally Retarded Man

David Steinberg, Lahey Clinic Medical Center

SESSION 4: EMPIRICAL RESEARCH

Nine Years and 500 Consults Later: A Data Summary of What We Did, and What We Learned
Anne L. Flamm, Martin L. Smith, and Garrett Walsh, The University of Texas M. D. Anderson Cancer Center

How do physicians deal with ethical difficulties on their own? A few things every ethics consultant should know

Samia Hurst, Sara Chandros Hull, and Marion Danis, National Institutes of Health; Gordon DuVal, University of Toronto Joint Centre for Bioethics

A Profile of the Ethics Consultant

Thomas May, Medical College of Wisconsin; J.M. Craig, Memorial Health System and Southern Illinois University School of Medicine

SESSION 2: MODELS AND FOUNDATIONS

Assessing Conflicts Among Consultants', Clinicians', Patients', and Organizations' Values in Ethics Consultation

Ana Iltis, Rice University

Rock or sand? Examining foundations of ethics consultation

Timothy Lillie, The University of Akron

12:15 p.m. Lunch

1:30 p.m. Plenary Session

Ethics Consultation and Ethical Case Deliberation: A European Perspective

Norbert L. Steinkamp, Ph.D.

University Medical Centre Nijmegen

3:00 p.m. Break

3:15-5:00 Concurrent Sessions

SESSION 6: EDUCATING CONSULTANTS

Training in the Theory and Practice of Clinical Ethics Consultation: Eight years' experience from an accredited graduate school course

Arthur R. Derse and Cynthia J. Morgenweck, Medical College of Wisconsin

Integrating the "Clinical" into the Education of Bioethicists: The Role of the Clinical Ethics Fellowship

Paula Chidwick, William Osler Health Centre; Laurie Hardingham, Toronto Rehabilitation Institute/University of Toronto Joint Centre for Bioethics

The Role of Multidisciplinary Seminars in Cultivating Core Competencies in Ethics Consultation: Spirituality in Cancer Patient Care

Sumi Moon, The University of Texas M. D. Anderson Cancer Center

SESSION 7: DEVELOPING PROGRAMS IN EUROPE

Clinical Ethics Committees in Swiss Hospitals: An Overview

Michelle Salathé, Hermann Amstad, Margrit Leuthold and Michel Vallotton, Swiss Academy of Medical Sciences

Ethics consultation in the absence of ethics consultants: Can committees provide the service?

Questions raised by recently established UK ethics committees

Anne Slowther, University of Oxford

Entering an Unknown Territory: Ethics Consultation at a German University Hospital as Ongoing Experiment

Thomas Wigant, Catholic Parish at the Heidelberg University Hospitals and Thorsten Schlenker, University of Heidelberg

SESSION 8: COMMON LAW MODEL AND COURTROOM INVOLVEMENT**Ethics Committees and the Courts**

Ronald E. Cranford, Lisa Ellis, and Ann Russell, Hennepin County Medical Center

Clinical Consultation and the Common Law Model of Precedent

Katie Watson, Northwestern University Medical School

SESSION 9: ROLE AND POWER ISSUES**Recognizing the Political in Clinical Ethics**

Christopher Meyers, California State University Bakersfield

Ethicists, ethicists and the goals of clinical ethics consultation

Frederick Adolf Paola and Robert Walker, University of South Florida College of Medicine

SESSION 10: AUTHORITY, EXPERTISE AND POWER**How Evidence-Based Medicine Might Benefit Ethics Consultation**

A.M. Issa and J.M. Craig, Southern Illinois University School of Medicine

From All Sides: A Comparative & Prospective Ethnographic Study of Ethics Consultation

Andrea Frolic, Rice University

5:00 p.m. Adjournment

April 5, 2003

8:30 a.m. Concurrent Sessions

8:30-10:30

SESSION 11: IMPROVING QUALITY**Continuous Quality Enhancement of The Ethics Consultation Program**

Laurence B. McCullough, Baylor College of Medicine

Project Evaluating Effectiveness in Clinical Ethics (PEECE)

Ross Upshur, Sue MacRae, and Clinical Ethics Group, University of Toronto Joint Centre for Bioethics

Appropriate Outcomes for Effective Ethics Consultation

David T. Ozar, Loyola University Chicago

SESSION 12: HOSPITAL ETHICS CONSULTATION EXPERIENCES**Evolution of Ethics Consultation at the Cleveland Clinic Foundation**

George J. Agich, Ph.D., Cleveland Clinic Foundation

The integration of clinical ethics within the hospital practice: A French experience

Armelle de Bouvet, Catholic University of Lille

Ethics Consultation at the Hospital of the University of Pennsylvania: It's primarily about communication

Mimi Mahon, and Horace M. DeLisser, Hospital of the University of Pennsylvania

SESSION 13: IMPACT OF LEGISLATIVELY ENDORSED CLINICAL ETHICS CONSULTATION**Experience With the Texas Advance Directives Act and the Resolution of Medical Futility (PANEL)**

Robert L. Fine, Min Patel, and Chaplain Bob Duncan, Baylor Health Care System

SESSION 14: ISSUES OF STATUS AND STANDARDS**Going Pro: Professional Status and the Roles of the Bioethics Consultant (PANEL)**

Kayhan Parsi (Moderator) and Mark Kuczewski, Loyola University Chicago
Deborah Cummins and Joal Hill, University of Illinois-Chicago

SESSION 15: METHODS AND MODELS**Criteria, and Advantages and Disadvantages for Three Methods of Ethics Consultation (PANEL)**

Martin L. Smith, Annette K. Bisanz, and Ana J. Kempfer, The University of Texas
M.D. Anderson Cancer Center

Ethics Committee and Ethical Case Deliberation on the Ward: An Interactive Model

Norbert L. Steinkamp, University Medical Centre Nijmegen

10:30 a.m. Break

10:45 a.m. Plenary Session
The Question of Accountability
Bethany Spielman, Ph.D., J.D.
Southern Illinois University

12:15 p.m. Lunch

1:30-3:45p.m. Concurrent Sessions

SESSION 16: WHAT WE HAVE LEARNED: ESTABLISHED CONSULTATION PROGRAMS**Bioethics Consultation at Toronto's Hospital for Sick Children: Evolution through 'reflective equilibrium' (PANEL)**

Christine Harrison, Alison Thompson, and Randi Zlotnik Shaul, The Hospital for Sick Children

Innovations in Clinical Ethics Case Consultation – Strengths, Weaknesses, and Future Directions (PANEL)

Lisa Anderson-Shaw, University of Illinois Medical Center; Susan MacRae, University of Toronto Joint Centre for Bioethics; Lainie Friedman Ross (presenter and moderator), University of Chicago

SESSION 17: PREREQUISITES FOR DOING ETHICS CONSULTATION**The Role of Clinical Expertise in Clinical Ethics Consultation (PANEL)**

Denise M. Dudzinski, Clarence Braddock III, and Mark Tonelli, University of Washington

Justice or 'Just This'?

Jeffrey Spike, University of Rochester Medical Center; Joy D. Skeel, Medical College of Ohio

SESSION 18: CONSULTATION IN PEDIATRIC SETTINGS**Team-based ethical decision making process in the example of a neonatal and pediatric intensive care unit**

Thomas M. Boesing, Christine Möhle, and Johannes Otte, The Gilead Hospital

To Feed or Not to Feed: Nutrition and Hydration in Pediatrics

Christine L. McHenry, Nancy Morwessel, William Scrivener, and Yvonne Stepter, Cincinnati Children's Hospital Medical Center

Culture Clash and Intersex: Case Presentation

Sharon E. Sytsma, Northern Illinois University

Ethics Consultation at a Pediatric Medical Center: What We Have Learned About Process

Christine L. McHenry, Nancy Morwessel, William Scrivener, and Yvonne Stepter, Cincinnati Children's Hospital Medical Center

SESSION 19: ETHICAL DECISION MAKING IN CHALLENGING SITUATIONS**Treatment Refusal and Decisional Competence Assessment**

David Bekelman, and J. Carrese, Johns Hopkins University

Completing Suicide: Limiting Life-Sustaining Treatment in Cases of Self-Inflicted Injury or Overdose

Robert Walker and Frederick Adolf Paola, University of South Florida College of Medicine

Ethical decisions with mentally and psychically challenged patients: An experience report from a ward for internal medicine

Joerg Stockmann, Mara Hospital; R. Kolloch, The Gilead Hospital

SESSION 20: ORGANIZATIONAL ETHICS**Ethics Consultation as a Tool for Diagnosing Problems in Organizational Ethics: The Case of End of Life Care**

F. Daniel Davis, Georgetown University

Why Clinical Ethics Committees should not address Organizational Ethics

Bob Hall, West Virginia State College

Administrative Ethics in a Community Hospital: Theoretical Insights and Practical Challenges

Daryl Pullman, Memorial University of St. John's; Rick Singleton, Health Care Corporation of St. John's

Duties, Conflicts and the Cultural Construction of the Deserving Patient: A Case Study of the Entanglement of Clinical and Organizational Ethics

Andrea Frolic, Rice University; Laurel Hyle, University of Houston

3:45 p.m. Break**4:00p.m. Plenary Session****American Society for Bioethics and Humanities Ethics Consultation Task Force
What are the Educational Prerequisites for Ethics Consultation?**

Mark Aulisio, Ph.D.

Case Western Reserve University

Jacqueline Glover, Ph.D.

West Virginia University

5:00 p.m. Adjournment

April 6, 2003**8:15- 10:15 Concurrent Sessions****SESSION 21: CONSULTATION IN SPECIALIZED SETTINGS****Ethics Consultation in Cardiovascular Intensive Care Units**

George J. Agich, Ph.D. and C. Allen Bashour, M.D., Cleveland Clinic Foundation

Ethics Problems and Ethics Consultation - The Research Experience

Gordon DuVal, University of Toronto Joint Centre for Bioethics; Marion Danis, National Institutes of Health

Making the Case for Ethics Consultations: Marginalization and Community Mental Health

Janet Hoy and Erika F. Feigenbaum, Case Western Reserve University

The Slowest Determines the Speed — Ethical Conflicts at a Hospice

H.-J. Flender, M. Kühnen, F. Mertzluft; M. Klemm, M. Rauch, and D. Dommasch, The Gilead Hospital;

A. Rieffel, U.Lübbert, Home of Assurance Hospice

SESSION 22: PROCESS CONSIDERATIONS IN ETHICS CONSULTATION**Appropriate Extent and Length of Involvement**

Paul J. Ford, The Cleveland Clinic Foundation

Frank Virgil and His Three Daughters: Can Endotracheal Intubation Be a Comfort Measure?

Mark J. Bliton and Stuart G. Finder, Vanderbilt University Medical Center

Ethical Dilemma in a Patient with Brain Death after Cerebral Angioma Surgery

Klaus Kobert and Fritz Mertzlufft, The Gilead Hospital

SESSION 23: THEORETICAL APPROACHES TO ETHICS CONSULTATION**Reframing Clinical Ethics Consultations: A System's Approach**

Susannah L. Rose, Memorial Sloan-Kettering Cancer Center; Wayne Shelton, Albany Medical College

Ethics consultation process and family therapy techniques

John Z. Sadler, University of Texas Southwestern Medical Center

On the Role of the Clinical Ethicist

Mark P. Sheehan, Keele University

SESSION 24: CHALLENGES AND SOLUTIONS**What's Wrong with Ethics Consultation? A National Survey**

Gordon DuVal, University of Toronto Joint Centre for Bioethics; Marion Danis, National Institutes of Health

Putting the "Ethics" Back into Ethics Consultation: A Substantive, Cross-Cultural Critique of the "Mediation" Method as a Model of Clinical Ethics Consultation

Catherine Myser, Bioethics and Anthropology Consultation Service

Necessity and relevance of clinical ethics consultation

Gerald Neitzke, Hannover Medical School

10:15 a.m. Break**10:30 a.m. Plenary Session****Improving Quality in Ethics Consultation**

John Fletcher, Ph.D.

University of Virginia

11:30 a.m. Closing Session**12:00 p.m. Adjournment**